

Eritrea - Ethiopia Boundary Commission

DECISION

Regarding Delimitation of the Border

between

The State of Eritrea

and

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

By the Boundary Commission, composed of:

Professor Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC, President
Prince Bola Adesumbo Ajibola, SAN, KBE, CFR
Professor W. Michael Reisman
Judge Stephen M. Schwebel
Sir Arthur Watts, KCMG, QC

**DECISION Regarding Delimitation of the Border
between
The State of Eritrea, represented by:**

GOVERNMENT OF ERITREA

His Excellency Mr. Ali Said Abdella, Foreign Minister of the State of Eritrea, Agent
Professor Lea Brilmayer, Co-Agent, Legal Advisor to the Office of the President of Eritrea,
“Howard M. Holtzmann Professor of International Law”, Yale University School of Law
His Excellency Mr. Mohammed Suleiman Ahmed, Ambassador of the State of Eritrea to the
Netherlands

Mr. Habtom Gebremichael, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, State of Eritrea

Ms. Megan Munzert, Associate Legal Advisor to the Office of the President of Eritrea

COUNSEL AND ADVOCATES

Mr. O. Thomas Johnson, Covington and Burling; Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia
Professor James Crawford, SC, FBA, Whewell Professor of International Law, University of
Cambridge; Member of the Australian and English Bars; Member of the Institute of International
Law

COUNSEL AND CONSULTANTS

Mr. Eric Brown, Covington and Burling; Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia

Ms. Chiara Giorgetti, Dottoressa in Giurisprudenza, Università di Bologna

Ms. Karin Kizer, Covington and Burling; Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia

Ms. Natalie Klein, Debevoise and Plimpton; Barrister and Solicitor of the Supreme Court of
Australia

Professor Yemane Meshginna, Department of Political Science, the University of Asmara

Ms. Erin Casey, Yale University School of Law

Ms. Amanda Jones, Yale University School of Law

Ms. Suma Nair, Covington and Burling

and The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, represented by:

GOVERNMENT OF ETHIOPIA

His Excellency Mr. Seyoum Mesfin, Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Federal Democratic
Republic of Ethiopia, Agent

His Excellency Ambassador Mr. Fisseha Yimer, Ambassador of the Federal Democratic
Republic of Ethiopia to Switzerland and to the United Nations in Geneva, Co-Agent

Mr. Seifeselessie Lemma, Director of Legal Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Federal
Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

COUNSEL AND ADVOCATES

Mr. Ian Brownlie, CBE, QC, FBA, Chichele Professor of Public International Law (Emeritus),
University of Oxford; Member of the International Law Commission; Member of the English
Bar; Member of the Institut de droit international

Mr. B. Donovan Picard, Verner, Liipfert, Bernhard, McPherson & Hand, Washington DC;
Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia; Member of the Bar of the Supreme Court of the
United States

Mr. Rodman R. Bundy, Frere Cholmeley/Eversheds, Paris; avocat à la Cour d’appel de Paris,
Member of the New York Bar

Ms. Loretta Malintoppi, Frere Cholmeley/Eversheds, Paris; avocat à la Cour d’appel de Paris,
Member of the Rome Bar

Mr. Dylan D. Cors, Verner, Liipfert, Bernhard, McPherson & Hand, Washington DC; Member
of the Bar of the District of Columbia

COUNSEL AND CONSULTANTS

Mr. Scott Edmonds, International Mapping Associates, Columbia, Maryland, President

Mr. Robert Rizzutti, International Mapping Associates, Columbia, Maryland, Vice President

Ms. Cheryl Dunn, Frere Cholmeley/Eversheds, Paris; Member of the State Bar of California

Mr. Charles Claypoole, Frere Cholmeley/Eversheds, Paris; Solicitor of the Supreme Court of
England and Wales

Mr. Justin M. Cawley, Verner, Liipfert, Bernhard, McPherson & Hand, Washington, DC;
Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia

Mr. Gregson A. Thoms, III, Verner, Liipfert, Bernhard, McPherson & Hand, Washington, DC,
Consultant

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF MAPS	vii
GLOSSARY OF GEOGRAPHIC PLACE NAMES	ix
CHAPTER I – PROCEDURAL INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER II – SUBSTANTIVE INTRODUCTION	11
A. Background	11
B. The Subject of the Dispute – Geographical Description of the Boundary	13
1) The termini	13
2) The three sectors of the boundary	17
3) The western sector	17
4) The central sector	18
5) The eastern sector	19
CHAPTER III – THE TASK OF THE COMMISSION AND THE APPLICABLE LAW	21
A. Treaty Interpretation	21
B. Applicable International Law and the Subsequent Conduct of the Parties	24
1) Maps	25
2) <i>Effectivités</i>	28
3) Diplomatic and other exchanges tending to evidence admissions or assertions	29
C. Relevance of the Reference to the 1964 OAU Summit Declaration	29
D. The Present Decision Does Not Deal with Demarcation	30
CHAPTER IV – THE SECTOR COVERED BY THE 1900 TREATY (CENTRAL SECTOR)	31
A. The Interpretation of the 1900 Treaty	31
1) The Mareb River	34
2) The Belesa River	34
3) The upper reaches of the Muna and the overland link between the Belesa and the Muna	38
4) The eastern terminal point of the 1900 Treaty boundary	43
5) Object and purpose of the Treaty	45
6) Conclusions as to the boundary identified by the 1900 Treaty	46
B. Subsequent Conduct	48
1) The western part of the Belesa projection	49
(a) Conduct relevant to the exercise of sovereign authority (<i>effectivités</i>)	49
(b) Diplomatic and other similar exchanges and records	50
(c) Maps	50
(d) Conclusion regarding the western part of the Belesa projection	50

2) The eastern part of the Belesa projection	51
(a) Conduct relevant to the exercise of sovereign authority <i>(effectivités)</i>	51
(b) Diplomatic and other similar exchanges and records	51
(c) Maps	52
(d) Conclusion regarding the eastern part of the Belesa projection	52
3) The Endeli projection (Irob)	52
(a) Conduct relevant to the exercise of sovereign authority <i>(effectivités)</i>	53
(b) Diplomatic and other similar exchanges and records	53
(c) Maps	53
(d) Conclusion regarding the Endeli projection	53
4) The Bada region in the central sector	54
(a) Conduct relevant to the exercise of sovereign authority <i>(effectivités)</i>	55
(b) Diplomatic and other similar exchanges and records	55
(c) Maps	55
(d) Conclusion regarding the Bada region in the central sector	55
C. The Commission's Conclusions Regarding the 1900 Treaty Line as a Whole	56

CHAPTER V – THE SECTOR COVERED BY THE 1902 TREATY
(WESTERN SECTOR)

A. The Treaty Text	57
B. The Western Terminus	58
C. The Sector Setit-Mareb	60
1) Interpretation of the Treaty	61
(a) The terms of the Treaty	61
(b) The object and purpose of the Treaty	65
(i) The reference to Mount Ala Tacura	66
(ii) The incorporation of the Cunama into Eritrea	66
(c) The relation between the negotiations of May 1902 and the principal objective of the Treaty	68
2) Developments subsequent to the Treaty	69
3) Assessment of the situation as at 1935	81
4) The Position after 1935	83

CHAPTER VI – THE SECTOR COVERED BY THE 1908 TREATY
(EASTERN SECTOR)

A. The Text of the 1908 Treaty	85
B. The Physical Geography	86
C. Historical Background of the 1908 Treaty	86
D. The Commission's Decision	87
1) The nature of the exercise under the 1908 Treaty	87
2) The commencement of the boundary	88
3) The termination of the boundary	88
4) The method by which the boundary is to be drawn	88
(a) The geometric character of the delimitation	88
(b) The delimitative character of the Commission's task	89
(c) The meaning of the "coast"	89
(d) The Commission's delimitation method	89

5) Effect of subsequent conduct	90
6) The map evidence	93
CHAPTER VII – THE BOUNDARY LINE WITHIN RIVERS	95
CHAPTER VIII – <i>DISPOSITIF</i>	97
Decision	97
Maps Illustrating the Delimitation Line	101
Reference Points	101
APPENDIX A – The Subsequent Conduct of the Parties in the Sector Covered by the 1900 Treaty	107
APPENDIX B – The Location of the Cunama	119
APPENDIX C – Technical Note Relating to Maps	124

LIST OF MAPS

Map 1	Eritrea-Ethiopia Border Area	10
Map 2	Western Sector, 1902 Treaty, Claim Lines As Submitted by the Parties	14
Map 3	Central Sector, 1900 Treaty, Claim Lines As Submitted by the Parties	15
Map 4	Eastern Sector, 1908 Treaty, Claim Lines As Submitted by the Parties	16
Map 5	1900 Treaty Map	32
Map 6	Belesa and Endeli Projections	36
Map 7	Treaty Line As Established by the 1900 Treaty	47
Map 8	Mai Daro Map	62
Map 9	De Chaurand Map, Excerpt Corresponding to the Mai Daro Map	64
Map 10	International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Western Sector (in a scale of 1:1,000,000)	96
Map 11	International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Central Sector (in a scale of 1:360,000)	98
Map 12	International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Eastern Sector (in a scale of 1:1,000,000)	100
Map 13	International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (in a scale of 1:2,000,000)	105
Map 14	International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Central Sector (from the Belesa to the headwater of the Muna in a scale of 1:50,000)	(inside back cover)

Map 15 International Boundary between the State of Eritrea
and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia,
Central Sector (from the headwater of the Muna to
the confluence of the Muna and the Endeli in
a scale of 1:50,000) (inside back cover)

GLOSSARY OF GEOGRAPHIC PLACE NAMES

This Glossary contains names of those geographic features and locations referred to in the Decision of which there are variant spellings. The spelling used in the Decision is listed first in bold, followed by the variant(s).

A

Acchele Guzai – Akologuzay; Okologezay

Agame – Agamie

Ala Tacura – Ala Takura

Alitena – Alitiena

B

Baza – Baze; Basé

Belesa – Belessa; Mestai Mes; Ruba Dairo; Rubai Daro; Sur; Tserona

Bure – Burre

C

Cunama – Canama; Kunama

E

Enda Dashim – Enda Dascim; Ruba Enda Dascin

G

Gasc – Gash

Gogula – Collina Gugula

K

Kelloberda – Kolo Burdo

M

Mai Ambessa – Mai Anbessa

Mai Daro – Maidaro; Mai Doro

Maiteb – Maieteb; Maietebe; Maietebbe; Maitebbe

Maiten – Mai Ten; Mai Tenne; Mai Tenné; Maitenné

Mareb – Mereb

Mochiti – Moketti

Muna/Berbero Gado – Mai Muna; T. Mai Muna; Maj Mena; Mouna

S

Setit – Settite

Shimezana – Scimezana

Sittona – Maetebbe/Maeteb; Sittone

T

Tigray – Tigrai; Tigre