Eritrea - Ethiopia Boundary Commission

DECISION

Regarding Delimitation of the Border

between

The State of Eritrea

and

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

By the Boundary Commission, composed of:

Professor Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC, President
Prince Bola Adesumbo Ajibola, SAN, KBE, CFR
Professor W. Michael Reisman
Judge Stephen M. Schwebel
Sir Arthur Watts, KCMG, QC
DECISION Regarding Delimitation of the Border between The State of Eritrea, represented by:

GOVERNMENT OF ERITREA
His Excellency Mr. Ali Said Abdella, Foreign Minister of the State of Eritrea, Agent
Professor Lea Brilmayer, Co-Agent, Legal Advisor to the Office of the President of Eritrea, “Howard M. Holtzmann Professor of International Law”, Yale University School of Law
His Excellency Mr. Mohammed Suleiman Ahmed, Ambassador of the State of Eritrea to the Netherlands
Mr. Habtom Gebremichael, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, State of Eritrea
Ms. Megan Munzert, Associate Legal Advisor to the Office of the President of Eritrea
COUNSEL AND ADVOCATES
Mr. O. Thomas Johnson, Covington and Burling; Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia
Professor James Crawford, SC, FBA, Whewell Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge; Member of the Australian and English Bars; Member of the Institute of International Law
COUNSEL AND CONSULTANTS
Mr. Eric Brown, Covington and Burling; Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia
Ms. Chiara Giorgetti, Dottoressa in Giurisprudenza, Università di Bologna
Ms. Karin Kizer, Covington and Burling; Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia
Ms. Natalie Klein, Debevoise and Plimpton; Barrister and Solicitor of the Supreme Court of Australia
Professor Yemane Meshginna, Department of Political Science, the University of Asmara
Ms. Erin Casey, Yale University School of Law
Ms. Amanda Jones, Yale University School of Law
Ms. Suma Nair, Covington and Burling

and The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, represented by:

GOVERNMENT OF ETHIOPIA
His Excellency Mr. Seyoum Mesfin, Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Agent
His Excellency Ambassador Mr. Fisseha Yimer, Ambassador of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia to Switzerland and to the United Nations in Geneva, Co-Agent
Mr. Seifeselassie Lemma, Director of Legal Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
COUNSEL AND ADVOCATES
Mr. Ian Brownlie, CBE, QC, FBA, Chichele Professor of Public International Law (Emeritus), University of Oxford; Member of the International Law Commission; Member of the English Bar; Member of the Institut de droit international
Mr. B. Donovan Picard, Verner, Liipfert, Bernhard, McPherson & Hand, Washington DC; Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia; Member of the Bar of the Supreme Court of the United States
Mr. Rodman R. Bundy, Frere Cholmeley/Eversheds, Paris; avocat à la Cour d’appel de Paris, Member of the New York Bar
Ms. Loretta Malintoppi, Frere Cholmeley/Eversheds, Paris; avocat à la Cour d’appel de Paris, Member of the Rome Bar
Mr. Dylan D. Cors, Verner, Liipfert, Bernhard, McPherson & Hand, Washington DC; Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia
COUNSEL AND CONSULTANTS
Mr. Scott Edmonds, International Mapping Associates, Columbia, Maryland, President
Mr. Robert Rizzutti, International Mapping Associates, Columbia, Maryland, Vice President
Ms. Cheryl Dunn, Frere Cholmeley/Eversheds, Paris; Member of the State Bar of California
Mr. Charles Claypoole, Frere Cholmeley/Eversheds, Paris; Solicitor of the Supreme Court of England and Wales
Mr. Justin M. Cawley, Verner, Liipfert, Bernhard, McPherson & Hand, Washington, DC; Member of the Bar of the District of Columbia
Mr. Gregson A. Thoms, III, Verner, Liipfert, Bernhard, McPherson & Hand, Washington, DC, Consultant
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**LIST OF MAPS** ................................................................. vii  
**GLOSSARY OF GEOGRAPHIC PLACE NAMES** .......................... ix  
**CHAPTER I – PROCEDURAL INTRODUCTION** .......................... 1  
**CHAPTER II – SUBSTANTIVE INTRODUCTION** ......................... 11  
  A. Background .............................................................. 11  
  B. The Subject of the Dispute – Geographical Description of the Boundary 13  
    1) The termini ...................................................... 13  
    2) The three sectors of the boundary ............................. 17  
    3) The western sector ............................................ 17  
    4) The central sector ............................................ 18  
    5) The eastern sector ............................................ 19  
**CHAPTER III – THE TASK OF THE COMMISSION AND THE APPLICABLE LAW** .................................................. 21  
  A. Treaty Interpretation ............................................... 21  
  B. Applicable International Law and the Subsequent Conduct of the Parties 24  
    1) Maps .............................................................. 25  
    2) Effectivités .................................................. 28  
    3) Diplomatic and other exchanges tending to evidence admissions or assertions ........................................... 29  
  C. Relevance of the Reference to the 1964 OAU Summit Declaration ............ 29  
  D. The Present Decision Does Not Deal with Demarcation ...................... 30  
**CHAPTER IV – THE SECTOR COVERED BY THE 1900 TREATY (CENTRAL SECTOR)** .................................................. 31  
  A. The Interpretation of the 1900 Treaty ................................ 31  
    1) The Mareb River ............................................... 34  
    2) The Belesa River ............................................... 34  
    3) The upper reaches of the Muna and the overland link between the Belesa and the Muna ........................................ 38  
    4) The eastern terminal point of the 1900 Treaty boundary ........ 43  
    5) Object and purpose of the Treaty ................................ 45  
    6) Conclusions as to the boundary identified by the 1900 Treaty .... 46  
  B. Subsequent Conduct .................................................. 48  
    1) The western part of the Belesa projection .................... 49  
      (a) Conduct relevant to the exercise of sovereign authority  
      (effectivités) .................................................. 49  
      (b) Diplomatic and other similar exchanges and records .......... 50  
      (c) Maps ...................................................... 50  
      (d) Conclusion regarding the western part of the Belesa projection . 50
2) The eastern part of the Belea projection ........................................ 51
   (a) Conduct relevant to the exercise of sovereign authority
       (effectivités) ................................................ 51
   (b) Diplomatic and other similar exchanges and records .................. 51
   (c) Maps .................................................................. 52
   (d) Conclusion regarding the eastern part of the Belea projection ...... 52
3) The Endeli projection (Irob) .................................................. 52
   (a) Conduct relevant to the exercise of sovereign authority
       (effectivités) ................................................ 53
   (b) Diplomatic and other similar exchanges and records .................. 53
   (c) Maps .................................................................. 53
   (d) Conclusion regarding the Endeli projection ............................ 53
4) The Bada region in the central sector ....................................... 54
   (a) Conduct relevant to the exercise of sovereign authority
       (effectivités) ................................................ 55
   (b) Diplomatic and other similar exchanges and records .................. 55
   (c) Maps .................................................................. 55
   (d) Conclusion regarding the Bada region in the central sector ........ 55
C. The Commission’s Conclusions Regarding the 1900 Treaty Line as
   a Whole .................................................................. 56

CHAPTER V – THE SECTOR COVERED BY THE 1902 TREATY
   (WESTERN SECTOR) ............................................... 57
A. The Treaty Text .......................................................... 57
B. The Western Terminus .................................................... 58
C. The Sector Setit-Mareb ................................................... 60
   1) Interpretation of the Treaty .......................................... 61
      (a) The terms of the Treaty ........................................ 61
      (b) The object and purpose of the Treaty ......................... 65
         (i) The reference to Mount Ala Tacura ..................... 66
         (ii) The incorporation of the Cunama into Eritrea ......... 66
      (c) The relation between the negotiations of May 1902 and
         the principal objective of the Treaty ......................... 68
   2) Developments subsequent to the Treaty ............................. 69
   3) Assessment of the situation as at 1935 ............................... 81
   4) The Position after 1935 ............................................. 83

CHAPTER VI – THE SECTOR COVERED BY THE 1908 TREATY
   (EASTERN SECTOR) ............................................... 85
A. The Text of the 1908 Treaty ............................................. 85
B. The Physical Geography .................................................. 86
C. Historical Background of the 1908 Treaty ............................. 86
D. The Commission’s Decision ............................................. 87
   1) The nature of the exercise under the 1908 Treaty ................. 87
   2) The commencement of the boundary ................................ 88
   3) The termination of the boundary .................................... 88
   4) The method by which the boundary is to be drawn ............... 88
      (a) The geometric character of the delimitation ................ 88
      (b) The delimitative character of the Commission’s task ....... 89
      (c) The meaning of the “coast” .................................... 89
      (d) The Commission’s delimitation method ..................... 89
5) Effect of subsequent conduct .................................................. 90
6) The map evidence ............................................................. 93

CHAPTER VII – THE BOUNDARY LINE WITHIN RIVERS .................. 95

CHAPTER VIII – DISPOSITIF .................................................... 97

Decision ................................................................................. 97
Maps Illustrating the Delimitation Line ....................................... 101
Reference Points .................................................................. 101

APPENDIX A – The Subsequent Conduct of the Parties in the Sector
Covered by the 1900 Treaty ...................................................... 107

APPENDIX B – The Location of the Cunama ................................. 119

APPENDIX C – Technical Note Relating to Maps .......................... 124
# LIST OF MAPS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Map</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Map 1</td>
<td>Eritrea-Ethiopia Border Area</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 2</td>
<td>Western Sector, 1902 Treaty, Claim Lines As Submitted by the Parties</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 3</td>
<td>Central Sector, 1900 Treaty, Claim Lines As Submitted by the Parties</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 4</td>
<td>Eastern Sector, 1908 Treaty, Claim Lines As Submitted by the Parties</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 5</td>
<td>1900 Treaty Map</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 6</td>
<td>Belesa and Endeli Projections</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 7</td>
<td>Treaty Line As Established by the 1900 Treaty</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 8</td>
<td>Mai Daro Map</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 9</td>
<td>De Chaurand Map, Excerpt Corresponding to the Mai Daro Map</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 10</td>
<td>International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Western Sector (in a scale of 1:1,000,000)</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 11</td>
<td>International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Central Sector (in a scale of 1:360,000)</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 12</td>
<td>International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Eastern Sector (in a scale of 1:1,000,000)</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 13</td>
<td>International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (in a scale of 1:2,000,000)</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 14</td>
<td>International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Central Sector (from the Belesa to the headwater of the Muna in a scale of 1:50,000)</td>
<td>(inside back cover)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Map 15 International Boundary between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Central Sector (from the headwater of the Muna to the confluence of the Muna and the Endeli in a scale of 1:50,000) ........................................ (inside back cover)
This Glossary contains names of those geographic features and locations referred to in the Decision of which there are variant spellings. The spelling used in the Decision is listed first in bold, followed by the variant(s).

**A**

*Acchele Guzai* – Akologuzay; Okologezay  
*Agame* – Agamie  
*Ala Tacura* – Ala Takura  
*Alitena* – Alitiena

**B**

*Baza* – Baze; Basé  
*Belesa* – Belessa; Mestai Mes; Ruba Dairo; Rubai Daro; Sur; Tserona  
*Bure* – Burre

**C**

*Cunama* – Canama; Kunama

**E**

*Enda Dashim* – Enda Dascim; Ruba Enda Dascin

**G**

*Gasc* – Gash  
*Gogula* – Collina Gugula

**K**

*Kelloberda* – Kolo Burdo
M

Mai Ambessa – Mai Anbessa
Mai Daro – Maidaro; Mai Doro
Maiteb – Maieteb; Maietebe; Maietebbe; Maitebbe
Maiten – Mai Ten; Mai Tenne; Mai Tenné; Maitenné
Mareb – Mareb
Mochiti – Moketti
Muna/Berbero Gado – Mai Muna; T. Mai Muna; Maj Mena; Mouna

S

Setit – Settite
Shimezana – Scimezana
Sittona – Maetebbe/Maeteb; Sittone

T

Tigray – Tigrai; Tigre