ARBITRAL TRIBUNAL ESTABLISHED UNDER ARTICLE 32(1) OF THE
CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF THE MARINE ENVIRONMENT
OF THE NORTH-EAST ATLANTIC

IRELAND

v.

UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND

COUNTER-MEMORIAL OF THE UNITED KINGDOM

6 JUNE 2002
ARBITRAL TRIBUNAL ESTABLISHED UNDER ARTICLE 32(1) OF THE CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF THE MARINE ENVIRONMENT OF THE NORTH-EAST ATLANTIC

IRELAND

v.

UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND

COUNTER-MEMORIAL OF THE UNITED KINGDOM

6 JUNE 2002
CONTENTS

PART 1  INTRODUCTION.................................................................................1
A. Overview of this Counter-Memorial.............................................................1
B. The Subject of the Dispute.........................................................................3
C. Issues in Ireland’s Memorial Irrelevant to the Dispute as Formulated by Ireland....7

PART 2  BACKGROUND FACTS .....................................................................9
A. BNFL and the MOX Plant...........................................................................9
B. Principal Current Competitors and Customers...........................................11
C. The Process Followed in Redacting Information from the PA and ADL Reports.....12
D. The Excised Information...........................................................................16

PART 3  THE NATURE OF THE OBLIGATION UNDER
ARTICLE 9 OF THE OSPAR CONVENTION .............................................19

PART 4  THE INFORMATION SOUGHT BY IRELAND IS NOT
INFORMATION WITHIN ARTICLE 9(2) OF THE OSPAR CONVENTION .............24
A. The Interpretation of Article 9(2).................................................................24
B. The Requested Information does not fall within Article 9(2).........................25
C. Consequences of the Requested Information Falling outside Article 9(2) ..........29

PART 5  THE INTERPRETATION AND APPLICATION OF
ARTICLE 9(3) OF THE OSPAR CONVENTION...........................................32
A. English Law.................................................................................................33
   1. The Commercial Confidentiality Exemption under the 1992 Regulations......33
   2. The Commercial Confidentiality Exemption under Common Law...............38
   3. Conclusions on English Law......................................................................40
   4. Applicable International Regulations.........................................................41
   5. Conclusions...............................................................................................42
B. Commercial Confidentiality under International Instruments and
   Other National Laws ......................................................................................44
   1. International Instruments..........................................................................44
   2. Other National Laws..................................................................................47
   3. Conclusions...............................................................................................49
C. Ireland’s Contentions on Public Interest......................................................49

PART 6  THE COMMERCIAL CONFIDENTIALITY OF THE
REDACTED INFORMATION ....................................................................50
A. The Confidentiality of the Information Redacted from the PA and ADL Reports......50
   1. The PA and ADL redaction exercises.........................................................50
   2. Information provided in confidence............................................................51
   3. Commercial Confidentiality........................................................................52
   4. Conclusions...............................................................................................63
B. The Alleged Failure to Give Reasons...........................................................63

PART 7  CONCLUDING SUBMISSIONS ....................................................67
APPENDIX A  Survey of International Instruments concerned with Access to Information

A. Instruments concerned with Trade and Commercial Matters .................................68
B. Instruments concerned with the Environment ......................................................72
C. Conclusions..........................................................................................................74

APPENDIX B  Survey of National Legislation concerned with Access to Information

A. France..................................................................................................................75
B. Ireland..................................................................................................................76
C. Australia .............................................................................................................80
D. United States of America.....................................................................................83

THE OSPAR CONVENTION (ENGLISH TEXT) ......................................................89

THE OSPAR CONVENTION (FRENCH TEXT) .....................................................101
LIST OF ANNEXES

VOLUME I


VOLUME II


6. Letter of 13 September 2001 from the Agent for the United Kingdom to the Agent for Ireland.


11. Extracts from the summary records of the OSPARREV Group, responsible for the preparatory work leading to the OSPAR Convention.


VOLUME III


16. Parliamentary Commissioner for Administration, Case No A.1/95 – Refusal to provide full responses to information requests about the reprocessing of nuclear fuel at Dounreay.

17. Parliamentary Commissioner for Administration, Case No A.29/95 – Refusal to provide information about the economic viability of the Thermal Oxide Reprocessing Plant (THORP) at Sellafield.


24. Title 40, Code of Federal Regulations, Part 2 (Extracts: § 2.101(a); § 2.118; § 2.201(e); § 2.208).

